

RELG 2650 – Religion and Bioethics: Beliefs, Bodies, and Power

University of Virginia, Spring 2019

Professor: Nichole M. Flores, Ph.D.

Email: nichole.flores@virginia.edu

Office Phone: (434) 243-3937

Office: Gibson S433

Teaching Assistants: Eric Hilker,
Creighton Coleman, Elizabeth Cable

Class Meetings: MW 11-11:50,

Occasional Fridays 11-11:50

Class Location: Maury Hall 209

Prof. Flores Office Hours: M & Th, 12-1pm

Course Hashtag: #UVAreligiousBioethics

COURSE DESCRIPTION: What is the relationship between beliefs, bodies, and power? This course analyzes challenging ethical issues in religion and health care from various Christian (Catholic and Protestant), Jewish, and Islamic theological perspectives. We begin by exploring various bioethical frameworks (narrative, virtue, principles, social solidarity, etc.) before applying these methods to a range of practical issues: end of life care, maternal-fetal relations, human genetics, research ethics, and global health. In addition to theology and philosophy, the course engages the disciplines of politics, law, and public policy.

COURSE EXPECTATIONS AND POLICIES:

- **Students are expected to attend every lecture.** You are permitted two (2) absences for any reason (no instructor approval needed). Check in on Top Hat to receive credit for being present and on time.
- **Students are expected to arrive on time for class, which begins promptly at 11am.** Tardiness disrupts your professor and classmates. The habit of tardiness reflects poorly on your capacity for professionalism in any field that you may choose to pursue.
- **Students are expected to attend every discussion section.** You are permitted one (1) absence for any reason (no TA approval necessary). Additional absences require approval from TA. Unexcused absences will result in a reduction of your participation grade.
- **Students are expected to use laptops, tablets, and phones responsibly during class.** These devices are only permitted for taking notes and utilizing the Top Hat platform during class.
- **Students are expected to complete the assigned reading every week.** Please come to class (both lecture and discussion section) prepared to discuss and engage the *primary arguments and salient points* of each text, along with the *strengths and limitations* of each argument. Failure to complete reading and prepare for class will result in a reduction of your participation grade.
- **Students are expected to submit assignments by their designated deadlines.** Late assignments will not be accepted and thus will receive no credit. Extensions may be granted by your TA in consultation with Prof. Flores in extraordinary situations (possibly during documented medical or family emergency, but never due to conflict with another course's requirements). Please contact your TA with questions.
- **Students are expected to take both the midterm and the final exam on their scheduled dates.** Exams will only be rescheduled upon official approval of the

- Dean's Office, no exceptions.
- **Students with documented disabilities can expect appropriate accommodations whenever necessary.** All students with special needs requiring accommodations should present the appropriate paperwork from the Student Disability Access Center (SDAC). It is the student's responsibility to present this paperwork in a timely fashion and follow up with the instructor about the accommodations being offered. Accommodations for examinations (e.g., extended time, low distraction environment) should be arranged at least one week before an exam. The SDAC is located in the Department of Student Health and can be contacted at (434) 243-5180/5181.
 - **Student athletes are expected to present official notification of expected absences as soon as this information is available.** Exams may not be proctored by team academic representatives, no exceptions.

HONOR CODE: Students are to comply with all of the provisions of the University's Honor Code. By enrolling in this course, the student has agreed to abide by and uphold the Honor System of the University of Virginia, as well as the following policies specific to this course:

- **All graded assignments must be pledged.** Please record your pledge at the end of each written assignment and examination. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about pledging assignments.
- **Collaboration in the form of discussion (study groups for exams) and peer review (for response essays) is permitted for this course.** Discussing essay ideas and consulting other students for help refining arguments, revision feedback, and editing is encouraged in this class. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about acceptable collaboration.
- **Unattributed use of material is prohibited on all assignments in this course.** Parenthetical citation is acceptable for response essays and direct quotations in exams. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about citation.
- **Posting PowerPoint presentations to online sources, either public or private, is prohibited for this class.** This is an infringement of intellectual property rights and will be reported to the University.
- **Recording lectures is strictly prohibited.** Exceptions for recording will be made for students with SDAC approval.
- **Recording any part of lecture and/or posting to social media (i.e. Snapchat, YouTube) without the professor's permission is prohibited for this class.**
- **Suspected violations will be forwarded to the Honor Committee.** Further, Prof. Flores may decide to assign a score of zero on the assignment in question regardless of any action taken by the Honor Committee.

Please consult Prof. Flores any questions regarding the course honor policy. If you believe you may have committed an Honor offense, you may wish to file a **Conscientious Retraction** by calling the Honor Offices at (434) 924-7602. For your retraction to be considered valid, it must be filed with the Honor Committee before you are aware that the act in question has come under suspicion by anyone. More information can be found at <http://www.virginia.edu/honor>. Your Honor representatives can be found at: <http://www.virginia.edu/honor/2015-2016-representatives/>.

GRADING POLICY: Written work is graded based on persuasiveness of

thesis/argument, quality and authoritativeness of **evidence** (quality and factual correctness), **writing quality**, and depth of **analysis/insight**. Further, essays should model both charitable and critical engagement with the myriad religious perspectives explored in class. *Ad hominem* attacks on any author or religious perspective will be viewed negatively by the party responsible for grading the work (e.g. “The author is obviously stupid” or “People from X religion are depraved,” etc.)

- **Appealing Grades: A student may email TA to request an appointment for grade review, but must wait 48 hours after an assignment has been returned.** The TA will hear the case before consulting Prof. Flores for a final decision. Grade reviews can result in grade increase or reduction, or confirm the initial assigned grade.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS: Course grades will be based on the following elements:

- **Participation – 10%** This portion of your grade is based on three elements:
 - **Adherence to course policies** (see “Course Expectation and Policies” and “Honor Code” sections for details)
 - **Quality of contribution to discussion section.** Each student is expected to contribute to discussion section.
 - **Friday Symposium Attendance.** Each student is required to attend one (1) Friday Symposium event over the course of the semester. To keep the symposia small, spots are limited. Please sign-up to secure a spot and sign-in to receive credit.
- **Reading Response Essay – 20%**
 - **Preparation of one (1) response essay, 4-6 pages long.** The essay will make an argument in relation to the reading for the week for which you sign up.
 - **Discussing essay during section.** During discussion section, your TA will ask you to say a few words about your essay; be prepared to discuss what you wrote (your argument, etc.) during section.
 - **Rewrite option.** Once you receive your initial grade, you will have an opportunity to rewrite your essay and to have it regraded. Your highest grade will stand. You are welcome to meet with your TA to discuss their feedback.
 - Requirements and schedule sign-up will be provided during discussion section.
- **Midterm Examination – 30%**
- **Final Examination – 40% (Thursday, May 2, 9am-12pm)**

FRIDAY SYMPOSIA SCHEDULE: Friday Symposia offer students the opportunity to discuss topics of interest with Prof. Flores in a smaller setting than the general lecture. Symposia are held in from 11-11:50 in the regular lecture hall; please sign-up to secure a spot and sign-in to receive credit. 2019 topics will include sports, television/film, and ecology.

1. **January 25**, “Religion, Bioethics and Sports”
2. **February 8**, “Religion and Bioethics on Screen”
3. **March 1**, “Religion, Bioethics and Ecology”

REQUIRED TEXTS: (Course texts are on reserve at Clemons Library.)

1. **(B&C)** Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, ***Principles of Biomedical Ethics***, seventh edition, (Oxford University Press, eBook available)

2. Rebecca Skloot, *The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks* (Broadway Books, eBook available)
3. (CR) Course Reader – Available for purchase from N.K. Print & Design
4. Top Hat platform: <https://tophat.com> (Join Code: 959581)

COURSE SCHEDULE: *Indicates readings new to Spring 2019 course reader

PART I: TRADITIONS AND METHODS IN THEOLOGICAL BIOETHICS

Week 1 – January 14 & 16

Introduction: Bodies, Beliefs, and Power (22)

(CR) Childress and Siegler, “Metaphors and Models of Doctor-Patient Relationships: Their Implications for Autonomy” (12)

(CR) Kaveny, “The Limited Descriptive Reach of Public Reason” (10)

Week 2 – January 21 & 23

Language: Metaphor, Rhetoric, and Narrative (101)

Skloot, Prologue and Chapters 1, 3, 4, 7, 11, 12, 13, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25, 27 (101)

Week 3 – January 28 & 30

Encountering Religious Perspectives (59)

(CR) Kelly, Magill, & Have, “Religion and Health Care” (7)

(CR) Kelly, Magill, & Have, “The Dignity of Human Life” (14)

(CR) Dorff, “The Jewish Tradition: Religious Beliefs & Health Care Decisions” (5)

(CR) Meilaender, “Christian Vision” (9)

(CR) Sachedina, “Health and Suffering” (24)

Week 4 – February 4 & 6

Exploring Methods in Bioethics: Principles (60)

B&C, Chapter 1, “Moral Norms,” pp. 13-25 (13)

B&C, Chapter 4, “Respect for Autonomy,” pp. 101-114 (14)

B&C, Chapter 5, “Nonmaleficence,” pp.150-156 (7)

B&C, Chapter 6, “Beneficence,” pp. 214-226, 229-232 (17)

B&C, Chapter 8, “Professional-Patient Relationship,” pp. 302-310 (9)

Weeks 5 – February 11 & 13

Exploring Methods in Bioethics: Critiques of Principles and New Directions (58)

(CR) Mustafa, “Islam and the Four Principles of Medical Ethics” (4)

(CR) Myser, “Differences from Somewhere: The Normativity of Whiteness in Bioethics in the United States” (12)

(CR) Zoloth, “Heroic Measures: Just Bioethics in an Unjust World” (6)

(CR) Cahill, “Participatory Bioethics in Action” (27)

(CR) Keenan, “What Does Virtue Ethics Bring to Genetics?,” pp. 97-105 (9)

FILM: *The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks* (Watch online via UVA Library)

Week 6 – February 18 & 20

Exploring Methods in Bioethics: Justice and Human Rights (54)

B&C, Chapter 7, 249-262 (14)

(CR) Farmer, "Health, Healing, and Social Justice: Insights from Liberation Theology" (28)

(CR) Fenton, "Bioethics and Human Rights" (12)

MIDTERM REVIEW CLASS – Wednesday, February 20

Week 7 – February 25 & 27

End of Life Care I: Decisions and Determinations (35)

(a) Theological Reasoning:

(CR) Sachedina, "Death and Dying" (27)

(CR) Gillick, "Artificial Nutrition and Hydration..." (4)

(CR) Address of Pope John Paul II (20 March, 2004) (4)

MIDTERM EXAM – Wednesday, February 27 (In Class)

NO DISCUSSION SECTION MEETINGS

PART II: ISSUES IN BIOETHICS

Week 8 – March 4 & 6

End of Life Care II: Decision and Determinations (43)

b) Public Determinations:

(CR) President's Commission, "Understanding the 'Meaning' of Death," pp. 31-43 (13)

(CR) President's Council on Bioethics, "The Limited Wisdom of Advanced Directives" (13)

B&C, Chapter 5, pp. 158-174 (17)

Week 9 – March 11 & 13

SPRING BREAK – NO LECTURE OR DISCUSSION SECTION MEETINGS

Week 10 – March 18 & 20

End of Life Care III: Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide (PAS) (55)

B&C, Chapter 5, pp. 174-186 (13)

(CR) Oregon Death with Dignity Act (2014 report) (6)

(CR) Quill, "Doctor, I Want to Die. Will You Help Me?" (4)

(CR) Pellegrino, "Compassion Needs Reason Too" (2)

(CR) Callahan, "When Self-Determination Runs Amok" (4)

(CR) CDF, *Declaration on Euthanasia* (6)

(CR) Meilander, "Euthanasia and Christian Vision" (11)

(CR) O'Laughlin, "The Politics of Life and Death" (9)

Week 11 – March 25 & 27

Organ and Tissue Transplantation (46)

(CR) Satel, "An Internet Lifeline, in Search of a Kidney" (5)

(CR) Satel, "Why People Don't Donate Their Kidneys" (4)

(CR) Sandel, "How Markets Crowd Out Morals" (2)

(CR) Kelly, "International Organ Trafficking Crisis: Solutions Addressing the Heart of the Matter" (33)

B&C, Chapter 2, pp. 54-55 (2)

FILM: *Tales from the Organ Trade* (Watch online via UVA Library)

Week 12 – April 1 & 3**Maternal-Fetal Relations I: Abortion and Conscientious Refusal in Health Care (73)****a) *Abortion as a Moral and Legal Issue***

(CR) Declaration of the Pontificate Council for the Family regarding ‘Embryonic Reduction’ (2)

(CR) Rosner, “Pregnancy Reduction in Jewish Law” (5)

(CR) SCOTUS, “Roe v. Wade: Majority Opinion and Dissent” (5)

(CR) Beckwith, “Roe v. Wade: Its Logic and Legacy” (18)

(CR) Manian, “The Consequences of Abortion Restrictions for Women’s Healthcare” (21)

(CR) Asch, “Can Aborting ‘Imperfect’ Children Be Immoral?” (4)

b) *Conscientious Refusal:*

(CR) ACOG Committee Opinion, “The Limits of Conscientious Refusal” (6)

(CR) Dresser, “Professionals, Conformity, and Conscience” (2)

(CR) NPR, “Birth Control at the Supreme Court: Does Free Coverage Violate Religious Freedom?” (5)

(CR) Greenhouse, “Birth Control Continues to Bedevil the Supreme Court” (5)

Week 13 – April 8 & 10**Maternal-Fetal Relations II: Emerging Perspectives, Alternative Strategies (46)**

(CR) Jacobs, “Opposition to Breast-Feeding Resolution by U.S. Stuns World Health Officials (4)*

(CR) Villarosa, “Why America’s Black Mothers and Babies Are in a Life-or-Death Crisis” (15)*

(CR) American Association of Pediatrics, “AAP Statement Opposing the Border Security and Immigration Reform Act” (1)*

(CR) Rubio, “Abortion: Toward Cooperation with the Good” (26)

Week 14 – April 15 & 17**Human Genetics (39)**

(CR) U.S. Supreme Court, *Buck v. Bell* (1927) (4)

(CR) Gould, “Carrie Buck’s Daughter” (9)

(CR) Mundy, “A World of Their Own,” (8)

(CR) Kilner, “The Ends Don’t Justify the Genes” (2)

(CR) Mitchell, “Hurling Toward Eugenics...Again” (3)

B&C, “The Concept of Privacy,” pp. 312-324 (13)

FILM: *The Lynchburg Story* (watch online via UVA Library)

Week 15 – April 22 & 24**Research Ethics (59)**

(CR) *The Nuremberg Code* (1)

(CR) Emanuel, et. al., “What Makes Clinical Research Ethical?” (10)

(CR) Townes, “The Doctor Ain’t Taking No Sticks: The Tuskegee Syphilis Study” (26)
B&C, “The Meaning and Justification of Informed Consent,” pp. 120-141 (22)

FILM: *The Deadly Deception* (Watch online via UVA Library)

Week 16 – April 29 & May 1

Justice & Health Care Ethics (19)

B&C, Chapter 7, “Justice,” pp. 270-276 (7)

(CR) Arras, “The Right to Health Care” (12)*

FINAL REVIEW CLASS – Wednesday, May 1

FINAL EXAMINATION – Thursday, May 2, 9am-12pm