

RELG 2650: Theology, Ethics, and Medicine

(Theological Bioethics)

University of Virginia, Fall 2016

Professor: Nichole M. Flores, Ph.D.

Email: nichole.flores@virginia.edu

Office Phone: (434) 243-3937

Office: Gibson S433

Twitter: @nicholemflores

Couse Hashtag: #UVAReligiousBioethics

Class Meetings: MW 11-11:50,

Occasional Fridays 11-11:50

Discussion Sections TBD

Class Location: Wilson 402

Prof. Flores Office Hours: TBD

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

This course analyzes various moral problems in health care from Christian (Catholic and Protestant), Jewish, and Islamic theological perspectives with reference to salient influences from philosophical ethics. In addition to theology and philosophy, the course material engages the disciplines of medicine, law, politics, public policy, and global health. The interdisciplinary nature of the course calls upon students to think constructively about some of the major debates in bioethics today: end of life care, maternal-fetal relations, genetics and human enhancements, research ethics, and health care access on local, national, and international scales.

N.B: *The syllabus is an organic document, subject to change. Adjustments to the reading schedule and assignment details are announced at the beginning of each lecture; each student is responsible for keeping track of updates. Utilize the notation space below each section to record adjustments.*

COURSE EXPECTATIONS AND POLICIES:

- **You are expected to attend every lecture.**
- **You are expected to arrive on time for class, which begins promptly at 11am.**
Tardiness disrupts your professor and classmates. The habit of tardiness reflects poorly on your capacity for professionalism in any field that you may choose to pursue.
- **You are expected to attend every discussion section.** You are permitted one (1) absence for any reason (no TA approval necessary). Additional absences require approval from TA. Unexcused absences will result in a reduction of your participation grade.
- **You are expected to switch your cell phone to silent or vibrate prior to every class.** Please store your device away from your work surface. Unapproved use of cell phones during class will result in a reduction of your participation grade.
- **You are expected to use laptops and tablet devices responsibly during class.**
These devices can be powerful tools in the classroom setting. While they can be a catalyst for engagement and productivity, they can also distract from the communal interaction and conversation that is the foundation of liberal arts education. Thus, these devices are permitted for taking notes, for viewing texts, and for facilitating group work only.
- **You are expected to complete the assigned reading every week.** Please come to

class (both lecture and discussion section) prepared to discuss and engage the ***primary arguments, salient points, and possible critiques*** of each text. Failure to complete reading and prepare for class will result in a reduction of your participation grade.

- **You are expected to submit assignments by their designated deadlines.** Late assignments will not be accepted and thus will receive no credit. Extensions may be granted by your TA in consultation with Prof. Flores in extraordinary situations (possibly during documented medical or family emergency, but never due to conflict with another course's requirements). Please contact your TA with questions.
- **Students with documented disabilities can expect appropriate accommodations whenever necessary.** All students with special needs requiring accommodations should present the appropriate paperwork from the Student Disability Access Center (SDAC). It is the student's responsibility to present this paperwork in a timely fashion and follow up with the instructor (in this case, the discussion section TA) about the accommodations being offered. Accommodations for examinations (e.g., extended time, low distraction environment) should be arranged at least one week before an exam. The SDAC is located in the Department of Student Health and can be contacted at (434) 243-5180/5181.
- **Student athletes are expected to present official notification of expected absences as soon as this information is available.**

HONOR CODE:

Prof. Flores trusts every student to comply with all of the provisions of the University's Honor Code. By enrolling in this course, the student has agreed to abide by and uphold the Honor System of the University of Virginia, as well as the following policies specific to this course:

- **All graded assignments—response essays, examinations, and event attendance—must be pledged.** Please record your pledge at the end of each written assignment and examination. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about pledging assignments.
- **Collaboration in the form of discussion (study groups for exams) and peer review (for response essays) is permitted for this course.** Discussing essay ideas and consulting other students for help refining arguments, revision feedback, and editing is encouraged in this class. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about acceptable collaboration.
- **Unattributed use of material is prohibited on all assignments in this course.** Parenthetical citation is acceptable for response essays and direct quotations in exams. Please consult your TA if you have any questions about citation.
- **Suspected violations will be forwarded to the Honor Committee.** Further, Prof. Flores may decide to assign a score of zero on the assignment in question regardless of any action taken by the Honor Committee.

Please consult your TA if you have any questions regarding the course honor policy.

If you believe you may have committed an Honor offense, you may wish to file a Conscientious Retraction by calling the Honor Offices at (434) 924-7602. For your retraction to be considered valid, it must be filed with the Honor Committee before you are aware that the act in question has come under suspicion by anyone. More information can be found at <http://www.virginia.edu/honor>. Your Honor representatives can be found at: <http://www.virginia.edu/honor/2015-2016-representatives/>.

GRADING POLICY:

Written work is graded based on persuasiveness of **thesis/argument**, quality and authoritativeness of **evidence** (quality and factual correctness), **writing quality**, and depth of **analysis/insight**. Further, essays should model both charitable and critical engagement with the myriad religious perspectives explored in class. *Ad hominem* attacks on any author or religious perspective will be viewed negatively by the party responsible for grading the work (e.g. “The author is obviously stupid” or “People from X religion are depraved,” etc.)

- **Appealing Grades:** *A student may email TA to request an appointment for grade review, but must wait 48 hours after an assignment has been returned.* The TA will hear the case before consulting Prof. Flores for a final decision. Grade reviews can result in grade increase or reduction, or confirm the initial assigned grade.
- **A Note on Drafts:** *TAs have been instructed to not read drafts of written assignments in this class.* They will, however, meet with you during their designated office hours to discuss your paper topic.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS: Course grades will be based on the following elements:

- **Policy Adherence, Participation, and Event Attendance – 10%** This portion of your grade is based on three elements:
 - **Adherence to course policies** (see “Course Expectation and Policies” and “Honor Code” sections for details)
 - **Quality of contribution to discussion section.** Each student is expected to contribute to discussion section. Occasional contributions during lecture will be considered favorably in evaluation, but are not required.
 - **Attendance at least three (3) outside events** related to course material over the course of the semester. Please report your attendance to your TA via email (so s/he has a record). Attendance at events is pledged. This grade will be based on TA’s records and reasoned judgement.
- **Reading Response Essays – 20%**
Preparation and presentation to discussion section of three (3) short response essays (maximum length: 2 pages each) Each essay will make an argument in relation to the reading. Requirements and schedule sign-up will be provided during discussion section.
- **Midterm Examination – 30%**
- **Final Examination – 40%**

REQUIRED TEXTS:

- Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, ***Principles of Biomedical Ethics***, seventh edition, (Oxford University Press, eBook available)
- Lisa Sowle Cahill, ***Theological Bioethics: Participation, Justice, and Change*** (Georgetown University Press, eBook available)
- Paul Farmer and Gustavo Gutierrez, ***In the Company of the Poor: Conversations with Dr. Paul Farmer and Fr. Gustavo Gutierrez***, eds. Michael Griffin and Jennie Weiss Block (Orbis Books, eBook available)
- **(CR)** Course Reader – Available for purchase from N.K. Print & Design
- **(OR)** Online Resource – Please follow provided links to access resources

All course texts are on reserve at Clemons Library.

COURSE SCHEDULE:

N.B.: *Approximate page counts are listed for each week and each text as a tool to help allocate reading time. The actual time required for completing readings, however, will largely depend on the particular student.*

PART I: TRADITIONS AND METHODS IN THEOLOGICAL BIOETHICS

Week 1 – August 24

Theological Bioethics: Bodies, Beliefs, and Power (16 Pages)

(CR) Skloot, “The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks, the Sequel” (4 Pages)

Cahill, “Introduction” (12 pages)

(OR): “Henrietta’s Tumor”: <http://www.radiolab.org/story/91716-henriettas-tumor/>

(Listen to the audio recording)

(OR): “HeLa Cells”: <https://vimeo.com/9581140> (watch the video)

Week 2 – August 29 & 31

Engaging Religious Perspectives (73 Pages)

(CR) Dorff, “The Jewish Tradition: Religious Beliefs & Health Care Decisions” (5 Pages)

(CR) Meilaender, “Christian Vision” (9 Pages)

(CR) Sachedina, “Health and Suffering” (24 Pages)

(CR) USCCB, “Ethical and Religious Directives for Catholic Health Care,” Part I (4 Pages)

Cahill, Chapter 1, “Theologians and Bioethics: Some History and a Proposal” (30 pages)

Week 3 – September 5 & 7

Exploring Methods in Bioethics (53 Pages)

(CR) Childress and Siegler, “Metaphors and Models of Doctor-Patient Relationships: Their Implications for Autonomy” (12 pages)

(CR) Zoloth, “Language, Narrative, and Desire: What We Yearn For” (14 pages)

Cahill, Chapter 2, “Participatory Theological Bioethics in Action” (27 pages)

Week 4 – September 12 & 14

Autonomy, Community, and Justice (86 Pages)

B&C, Chapter 4, “Respect for Autonomy” (41 Pages)

B&C, Chapter 7, “Justice” (45 Pages)

Week 5 – September 19 & 21**Beneficence, Nonmaleficence, and Autonomy (88 Pages)****B&C**, Chapter 5, “Nonmaleficence” (44 Pages)**B&C**, Chapter 6, “Beneficence,” pp. 214-226, 229-232, 237-241 (22 Pages)**B&C**, Chapter 8, “Professional-Patient Relationship,” pp. 302-324 (22 Pages)**Week 6 – September 26, 28 & 30****Critiques of Principles (35 Pages)****(CR)** Mustafa, “Islam and the Four Principles of Medical Ethics” (4 Pages)**(CR)** Zoloth, “Heroic Measures: Just Bioethics in an Unjust World” (6 Pages)**(CR)** Myser, “Differences from Somewhere: The Normativity of Whiteness in Bioethics in the United States” (12 Pages)**(CR)** Keenan, “What Does Virtue Ethics Bring to Genetics?” (13 Pages)**MIDTERM REVIEW CLASS – Wednesday, September 28****MIDTERM EXAMINATION – Friday, September 30****FALL BREAK – Monday, October 4****PART II: ISSUES IN BIOETHICS****Week 7 – October 6****End of Life Care I: Religious Perspectives (76 Pages)****(CR)** CDF, “Declaration on Euthanasia” (6 Pages)**(CR)** Meilander, “Euthanasia and Christian Vision” (11 Pages)**(CR)** Sachedina, “Death and Dying” (27 Pages)**Cahill**, Chapter 3, “Decline and Dying: Cultural and Theological Interpretations” (32 Pages)**Week 8 – October 10 & 12****End of Life Care II: Decisions and Determinations (87 Pages)****(OR)** Gwande, “Letting Go” <http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2010/08/02/letting-go-2> (Approx. 24 Pages)**(CR)** Gillick, “Artificial Nutrition and Hydration...” (4 Pages)**(CR)** Address of Pope John Paul II (20 March, 2004) (4 Pages)**(CR)** President’s Council on Bioethics, “The Limited Wisdom of Advanced Directives” excerpts (13 Pages)**(CR)** President’s Commission, “Understanding the ‘Meaning’ of Death,” pp. 31-43 (13 Pages)**Cahill**, Chapter 4, “Decline and Dying: Principles of Analysis and Practices

of Solidarity” (29 Pages)

Quick Review:

B&C, pp. 188-193 (protecting incompetent patients)

Week 9 – October 17 & 19

End of Life Care III: Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide / Organ and Tissue Transplantation (75 Pages)

Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide:

- (CR) Oregon Death With Dignity Act (2014 report) (6 Pages)
- (CR) Quill, “Doctor, I Want to Die. Will You Help Me?” (4 Pages)
- (CR) Pellegrino, “Compassion Needs Reason Too” (2 Pages)
- (CR) Callahan, “When Self-Determination Runs Amok” (4 Pages)
- (CR) Kotva, “Dying in Oregon: A Critical Look at ‘Death with Dignity’” (4 Pages)

Organ and Tissue Transplantation:

- (CR) Satel, “An Internet Lifeline, in Search of a Kidney” (5 Pages)
 - (CR) Satel, “Why People Don’t Donate Their Kidneys” (4 Pages)
 - (OR) Sandel, “How Markets Crowd Out Morals,” <https://bostonreview.net/forum-sandel-markets-morals> (~11 Pages)
 - (CR) Emily Kelly, “International Organ Trafficking Crisis: Solutions Addressing the Heart of the Matter” (33 Pages)
 - B&C**, pp. 54-55 (2 Pages)
-
-
-

Week 10 – October 25 & 26

Maternal-Fetal Relations: Pregnancy, Birth, and Early Childhood (77 Pages)

- (CR) Klein, “Get the Epidural,” (5 Pages)
 - (OR) Zeh, “Get Compassion: Reflections on Childbirth and Privilege,” <https://feminismandreligion.com/2016/07/19/get-compassion-reflections-on-childbirth-and-privilege/> (~3 Pages)
 - (CR) West, “Policy: The Bible and Welfare Reform” (37 Pages)
 - (CR) Declaration of the Pontificate Council for the Family regarding ‘Embryonic Reduction’ (2 Pages)
 - (CR) Rosner, “Pregnancy Reduction in Jewish Law” (5 Pages)
 - Cahill**, Chapter 6, “Reproduction and Early Life,” pp. 167-193 (25 Pages)
-
-
-

Week 11 – October 31 & November 2

Maternal-Fetal Relations: Abortion (80 Pages)

- (OR)** “Roe v. Wade,” https://www.law.cornell.edu/supremecourt/text/410/113#writing-USSC_CR_0410_0113_ZD – Review the case, including Blackburn’s opinion and Rehnquist’s dissent
- (CR)** Beckwith, “Roe v. Wade: Its Logic and Legacy” (18 Pages)
- (CR)** Rubio, “Abortion: Toward Cooperation with the Good” (26 Pages)
- (CR)** Manian, “The Consequences of Abortion Restrictions for Women’s Healthcare” (21 Pages)
- (CR)** Asch, “Can Aborting ‘Imperfect’ Children Be Immoral?” (4 Pages)

Recommended:

- (OR)** “Roe v. Wade” (interactive website with audio of oral argumentation and images) <https://www.oyez.org/cases/1971/70-18>
- (OR)** Pew Forum, “A History of Key Abortion Rulings of the U.S. Supreme Court,” <http://www.pewforum.org/2013/01/16/a-history-of-key-abortion-rulings-of-the-us-supreme-court/>

Quick Review:

- B&C**, pp. 164-168 (rule of double effect/principle of double effect)
-
-
-

Week 12 – November 7 & 9

Human Genetics (84 Pages)

- (OR)** U.S. Supreme Court, *Buck v. Bell* (1927), <https://www.law.cornell.edu/supremecourt/text/274/200> (~2 Pages)
- (CR)** Gould, “Carrie Buck’s Daughter” (9 Pages)
- (OR)** Mundy, “A World of Their Own,” <https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/lifestyle/magazine/2002/03/31/a-world-of-their-own/abba2bbf-af01-4b55-912c-85aa46e98c6b/> (~27 Pages)
- (CR)** Kilner, “The Ends Don’t Justify the Genes” (2 Pages)
- (CR)** Mitchell, “Hurtling Toward Eugenics...Again” (3 Pages)
- Cahill**, Chapter 7, “Biotechnology, Genes, and Justice” (41 Pages)

Quick Review:

- (CR)** Keenan, “What Does Virtue Ethics Bring to Genetics?” (13 Pages)
- B&C**, pp. 312-324 (privacy and confidentiality)
-
-
-

Week 13 – November 14 & 16

Research Involving Human Subjects (37 Pages)

- (CR)** *The Nuremberg Code* (1 Page)
- (CR)** Emanuel, et. al., “What Makes Clinical Research Ethical?” (10 Pages)
- (CR)** Townes, “‘The Doctor Ain’t Taking No Sticks’: The Tuskegee Syphilis Study” (26 Pages)

Quick Review:

B&C, pp. 114-141 (informed consent), 267-270 (vulnerability & exploitation), pp. 331-340 (clinical investigation)

Week 14 – November 21 & 23

Thanksgiving Recess – *Class is cancelled for the entire week*

Pro Tip: Read Farmer & Gutierrez over break!

Week 15 – November 28 & 30**Global Health and Solidarity (138 Pages)**

(CR) Clark, “Engaging the Future of the Human Rights Project and Building Solidarity” (23 Pages)

Farmer and Gutierrez, Chapters 2-6 (115 Pages)

Quick Review:

B&C, pp. 249-262 (theories of justice)

Week 16 – December 5**Bioethics and Sports (45 Pages)**

(CR) Mehlman, “Enhancements in Sports” (24 Pages)

(CR) Ruiz, “I.O.C. Forces Russians to Prove They Have a Drug-Free Past” (6 Pages)

(CR) Kelly, “Yes, football kills people. Whatever.” (2 Pages)

(CR) Belson, “Synchronized Swimmers Find Danger Lurking Below Surface: Concussions” (5 Pages)

(CR) Hudson and Spradley, “Concussions: A Sports Ethics Commentary” (8 Pages)

Quick Review:

Cahill, Chapter 7, “Biotechnology, Genes, and Justice”

Examination Week