

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

<p>Dr. Nichole M. Flores, Associate Professor of Religious Studies & Director of Health, Ethics, & Society Minor Email: nmf5q@virginia.edu</p>	<p>Student Meetings Hours: Sign up at https://calendly.com/nmf5q Office Location: Gibson Hall 433 Office Phone: (434)243-3937</p>
--	---

Course Description:

How do religion and theology influence health care decision-making in various medical, social, legal, political, and economic contexts? This course analyzes challenging ethical issues in religion and health care from various Christian (Catholic, Orthodox, and Protestant), Jewish, and Islamic perspectives. Beginning with a study of major bioethical frameworks, this course invites students to think critically about a range of challenging practical issues in health care ethics and religion especially beginning of life care, end of life care, organ and tissue transplantation, research ethics, public health, and global health. Since bioethics is an inherently interdisciplinary method of study, course readings, lectures, discussions, and assignments will engage a diverse range of readings including ones from religious studies, theology, philosophy, law, public policy, political science, and medicine among other disciplines.

Expected Course Outcomes:

1. Students will be able to identify the importance of theology/ies, religion/s, the religious toward articulating a more nuanced understanding of their role in health care ethics.
2. Students will be conversant in several prominent ethical frameworks that influence health care ethics.
3. Students will practice articulating their own arguments on a range of challenging cases and ethical problems, including questions in health care ethics that influence medicine, law, culture, and politics in local, national, and global contexts.
4. Students will be able to identify theses/central arguments and supporting evidence in texts and other course material.
5. Students will practice respectful engagement with arguments with which they disagree, whether presented in our common texts, by their peers, by invited guest speakers, or by the instructor and teaching assistants.
6. Students will be invited to cultivate a classroom environment characterized by respect and collegiality, and possibly even friendship and good humor. A classroom thus characterized will help to foster and sustain discourse on challenging topics over the course of the semester and beyond.

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

Classroom Procedure:

1. ***Lecture will be held in Wilson 301 on Monday and Wednesday from 1-1:50pm.*** In general, students will attend lecture in person. There will be a recording of the lecture available on Collab if a student needs to quarantine or isolate due to health reasons.
2. ***Attendance will be recorded via Top Hat (more info about Top Hat platform can be found under "Required Texts").*** An attendance code will appear on the screen as students enter the lecture hall. Please enter the code using your mobile device to receive credit for attending the class. Students who are absent due to health quarantine should contact Prof. Flores to receive attendance credit.
3. ***Each student will need to use a laptop, smartphone, or tablet to use the Top Hat system during class.*** The instructor invites students to engage with lecture via Top Hat during lecture in a respectful and responsible manner.
4. ***Students are expected to read the assigned texts every week.*** Students are encouraged to make note of the thesis or central argument of each text as well as the evidence presented in support of the author's case. It would also benefit the students to make note of the reading's genre (or type) and audience along with its strengths and limitations.
5. ***Students are expected to submit assignments by their designated deadlines.*** Please consult with your teaching assistant if extraordinary circumstances (especially health-related circumstances) prevent you from submitting work by the due date.
6. ***Students with documented need for accommodations can expect them to be met in this course and all other courses.*** Please present the appropriate paperwork from the Student Disability Access Center (SDAC) early in the semester so that appropriate accommodations can be arranged.
7. ***Student athletes can expect accommodation of their travel schedules.*** Please present your letter noting any necessary absences to Prof. Flores at the beginning of the semester.

Honor Code:

All students have agreed to abide by and uphold the Honor System of the University of Virginia.

Students are also expected to abide by the honor policies specific to this course:

1. ***Please pledge all graded assignments.***
2. ***Unattributed use of material is not allowed on any assignment in this course.*** Please consult your TA if you have any questions about how to cite your sources in assignments for this class.
3. ***Students may study with other students for this course through the formation of study groups and/or creation of common google docs for class notes.*** These forms of cooperation might be particularly helpful in the ongoing landscape of pandemic learning.
4. ***Students may not post any of the course material*** (PowerPoints, quiz questions, video or audio recordings of lectures or discussion sections, exams) to either public or private online sources (including social media).

University of Virginia, Fall 2022**5. Suspected violations of the honor code will be forwarded to the Honor Committee.**

If you believe you may have committed an Honor offense, you may file a *Conscientious Retraction* by calling the Honor Offices at (434)924-7602.

Grading Scale:

1. *This course will employ the standard university grading scale.* (See below)
2. *Students may appeal a grade to be reviewed but all requests must be made at least 48 hours after an assignment has been returned.* An appeal will result in a review which could result in a higher grade, a lower grade, or the same grade.
3. *Per college policy, Prof. Flores and the TAs will not “round up” to the next highest letter grade.* This policy will hold for all assignments and final grades.

A+	100	C	73
A	95	C-	70
A-	90	D+	67
B+	87	D	63
B	83	D-	60
B-	80	F	0
C+	77	IN	Incomplete

Course Requirements:**Participation – 25%**

- Discussion Section Participation – 10% of final grade
- Top Hat participation – attendance, responding to questions/polls, etc. – 10% of final grade
- Outside event – Attend one (1) lecture outside of class (in person or via Zoom), write one paragraph about the lecture and what you learned, and submit to TA for credit – 5% of final grade

Midterm – 25% of final grade**Reading Response Essay – 25% (5% for presentation during discussion section, 20% for essay)**

- Write a 3-to-5-page essay that:
 - o (1) briefly discusses 2-3 readings pertaining to one of the topics discussed for a particular week (i.e. ethical challenges of physician assisted suicide, defensibility of organ transplantation markets, the ethical basis for either overturning or reaffirming *Roe v. Wade*),
 - o (2) takes a position on the topic in a clear, concise, and defensible thesis/argument articulated in the essay,
 - o (3) offers evidence in support of one’s thesis/argument on the topic, and
 - o (4) takes seriously counter arguments to one’s thesis/argument.

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

- Write your essay and be ready to discuss it during your discussion section during the week your readings are on the syllabus (you will sign up for a week to present during the first weeks of the semester).
- After presenting the paper, submit it to your TA for comments and grading.
- Once you receive your graded paper back from your TA you can:
 - o EITHER choose to keep the grade on the first draft (highly advisable if you earn an A, for example)
 - o OR choose to revise and resubmit the essay based on the comments you receive.
- Your TA will reread the essay and assign a grade to the second attempt. You will keep the grade you receive on the resubmission.

Final – 25% of final grade

Required Texts:

- **Top Hat Platform, Join Code: 930621** (Invitations to register for Top Hat sent to all students who were enrolled or on the waitlist by 8/20)
- **Tom L. Beauchamp and James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 8th edition (Oxford University Press 2019)** – Available via Collab through UVA Bookstore’s Inclusive Access Program. Inclusive Access allows students immediate access to the text at a significantly reduced price relative to the hard copy of the text. The Inclusive Access platform allows students to take notes, skip to different sections, and even listen to the text.
 - o **IMPORTANT: EVERY STUDENT IS AUTOMATICALLY ENROLLED IN THE INCLUSIVE ACCESS PROGRAM. STUDENTS CAN CHOOSE TO OPT OUT OF THE PROGRAM BY SEPTEMBER 6, 2022. AFTER 9/6/22, STUDENTS WHO HAVE NOT OPTED OUT WILL BE CHARGED \$35.99 TO THEIR STUDENT ACCOUNT FOR THE E-BOOK VERSION OF THE TEXT.**
 - o The hardcopy of this text will also be available for purchase at the UVA Bookstore. Owning a copy of the book could be a good choice for students who plan to pursue graduate studies in ethics or medicine.
- **Linda Villarosa, *Under the Skin: The Hidden Toll of Racism on American Lives and on the Health of Our Nation* (Doubleday 2022)** – Available for purchase at the UVA Bookstore
- **(CO) Reading Available in Collab “Resources” section**
- **(ON) Online Reading (links will appear in the syllabus)**

COURSE SCHEDULE

Week 1 – August 24

What is Religious Ethics? And why do religious beliefs, practices, and institutions matter for health care?

(CO) Charles Mathewes, “God and Morality,” in *Understanding Religious Ethics*, pp. 21-37

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

(CO) David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, and Henk ten Have, “Religion and Health Care” in *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*

Week 2 – August 26 & August 31

Narrative and Ethics: How do stories guide our decision-making in health care?

(CO) Rita Charon, “Narrative Features of Medicine” in *Narrative Medicine: Honoring the Stories of Illness*

Villarosa, Chapter 1, “Everything I Thought Was Wrong”

WATCH: *The Immortal Life of Henrietta Lacks*, 2017, 93min (streaming video available via UVA Library)

Week 3 – September 5 & 7 (Lecture this week will be pre-recorded and available in Collab)

How do Catholic, Protestant, Orthodox, Jewish, and Islamic traditions approach decision-making in health care?

(CO) David F. Kelly, Gerard Magill, and Henk ten Have, “The Dignity of Human Life” in *Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics*

(CO) Gilbert Meilander, “Christian Vision” in *Bioethics: A Primer for Christians*, 4th Edition

(CO) John Bekos, “Memory and Justice in the Divine Liturgy: Christian Bioethics in Late Modernity” in *Christian Bioethics*

(CO) Elliot N. Dorff, “Historical Introduction” in *The Jewish Tradition: Religious Beliefs and Health Care Decisions*

(CO) M.A. Al-Bar & H. Chamsi-Prasha, “Introduction” in *Contemporary Bioethics*

Week 4 – September 12 & 14

Is autonomy chief among the principles of biomedical ethics?

Beauchamp & Childress:

- Chapter 1, pp 1-5, 10-25
- Chapter 4, pp 99-112
- Chapter 8, pp 327-53

Week 5 – September 19 & 21

What do we owe to each other in medicine & health care?

Beauchamp & Childress:

- Chapter 7, pp 267-290
- Chapter 5, pp 155-68, 171-74, 181
- Chapter 6, pp 217-21, 230-42

Week 6 – September 26 & 28

Are there any alternative frameworks to the principles of biomedical ethics?

Beauchamp & Childress, Chapter 2, pp 31-45

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

(CO) Laurie Zoloth, “Heroic Measures: Just Bioethics in an Unjust World” in *Hastings Center Report*

(CO) Rita C. Manning, “A Care Approach” in *A Companion to Bioethics*, 2nd Edition

(CO) Lisa Sowle Cahill, “Participatory Theological Bioethics in Action” in *Theological Bioethics: Participation, Justice, and Change*

(ON) Bram Wispelwey and Michelle Morse, [“An Antiracist Agenda for Medicine”](#) in *Boston Review*

Week 7 – October 5

Reading Day (10/3) & Midterm Examination (10/12)

No Discussion Section

Week 8 – October 10 & 12

What are some theological approaches to end-of-life ethics?

(CO) Abdulaziz Sachedina, “Death and Dying” in *Islamic Bioethics: Principles and Application*

(CO) Jeffrey P. Bishop, “Prelude” in *The Anticipatory Corpse: Medicine, Power, and the Care of the Dying*

(CO) Celia Deane-Drummond, “The Ethics of Assisted Dying: A Case for a Recovery of Prudence Among the Virtues” in *Studies in Christian Ethics*

Week 9 – October 17 & 19

What are the ethical challenges of physician assisted suicide (PAS)?

(CO) Timothy E. Quill, “Doctor, I Want to Die. Will You Help Me?” in *Journal of the American Medical Association (JAMA)*

(CO) Edmund D. Pellegrino, “Compassion Needs Reason Too” in *JAMA*

(CO) Daniel Callahan, “When Self-Determination Runs Amok” in *Hastings Center Report*

(CO) Joseph J. Kotva Jr. “Dying in Oregon: A Critical Look at Death with Dignity” in *Christian Century*

(ON) Michael J. O’Laughlin, [“How Catholic Health Care is Fighting Against the Campaign for Physician-Assisted Suicide”](#) in *America*

Week 10 – October 24 & 26

What are some of the ethical challenges of organ and tissue transplantation?

(ON) Sally Satel, [“An Internet Lifeline, in Search of a Kidney”](#) in *The New York Times*

(ON) Sally Satel, [“Why People Don’t Donate Their Kidneys”](#) in *The New York Times*

(CO) Michael J. Sandel, “How Markets Crowd Out Morals” (excerpt) in *What Money Can’t Buy: The Moral Limits of Markets*

(CO) Emily Kelly, “International Organ Trafficking Crisis: Addressing the Heart of the Matter” in *Boston College Law Review*

WATCH: *Tales From the Organ Trade*, 2013, 82min (Access details forthcoming)

Week 11 – October 31 & November 2

What are some of the challenges facing beginning of life ethics?

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

(CO) Erika Bachiochi, [“What Makes a Fetus a Person?”](#) in *The New York Times*

(CO) Julie Hanlon Rubio, “Abortion: Toward Cooperation with Good” in *Hope for Common Ground: Mediating the Personal and the Political in a Divided Church*

(CO) Rebecca Epstein-Levi, “A Polyvocal Body: Mutually Corrective Discourses in Feminist and Jewish Bodily Ethics” in *Journal of Religious Ethics*

(ON) American Muslim Bar Association, [“The Islamic Principle of Rahma: A Call for Reproductive Justice”](#) on ambalegal.org

Week 12 – November 7 & 9

What are some of the ethical, legal, and political responses to Roe v. Wade, Casey v. Planned Parenthood, and Dobbs v. Jackson Women’s Health Organization? (60)

(ON) Francis J. Beckwith, [“Roe v. Wade: Its Logic and Its Legacy”](#) in *The Southern Baptist Journal of Theology*

(CO) Gillian Frank, “The Colour of the Unborn: Anti-Abortion and Anti-Bussing Politics in Michigan, United States, 1967-1973” in *Gender and History*

(CO) Lynn M. Paltrow, Lisa H. Harris, & Mary Faith Marshall, “Beyond Abortion: The Consequences of Overturning Roe” in *The American Journal of Bioethics*

(ON) SCOTUSblog, “Symposium on SCOTUS decision in Dobbs v. Jackson Women’s Health Organization” (The four essays below are required but I recommend reading all six essays in the [symposium](#)):

- Elizabeth R. Kirk and Dr. Ingrid Skop, [“Why the Dobbs decision won’t imperil pregnancy-related medical care”](#)
- Cari Jackson, [“The dangers of judicial cherry-picking”](#)
- Sherif Girgis, [“Dobbs’s history and the future of abortion and privacy law”](#)
- Radhika Rao, [“A eulogy to Roe”](#)

Recommended: Read/Review/Skim the SCOTUS decisions in *Roe*, *Casey*, and *Dobbs*. This is A LOT of reading which is why it is not assigned as required reading. But it would be helpful to spend time with the primary texts if you haven’t already done so in another context.

Week 13 – November 14 & 16

What does society owe women/birthing parents and children before, during, and after pregnancy and birth?

Villarosa:

- Chapter 3, “Unequal Treatment”
- Chapter 4, “Something About Being Black is Bad for Your Body and Your Baby”

(ON) LISTEN: James Coan, [“Children at the Border”](#) on *The Circle of Willis*

(ON) Carter O. Snead and Mary Ann Glendon, [“Opinion: The Pro-Life Movement Can’t Stop at the Unborn”](#) in *The Washington Post*

(CO) Buck v. Bell

(CO) Stephen Jay Gould, “Carrie Buck’s Daughter,” in *Contemporary Issues in Bioethics*, 4th Edition

University of Virginia, Fall 2022

WATCH: *The Lynchburg Story: Eugenic Sterilization in America*, 1995, 62 min. (Streaming video available via UVA Library)

Week 14 – November 21 & 23 (11/21 lecture recording will be available on Collab; no class will be held on 11/23)

How might medical ethics to respond to legacies of anti-blackness in research settings?

Villarosa, Chapter 2, “The Dangerous Myth That Black Bodies are Different”

(CO) Emilie M. Townes, “The Doctor Ain’t Taking No Sticks’: The Tuskegee Syphilis Study” in *Breaking the Fine Rain of Death: African American Health Issues and a Womanist Ethic of Care*

(CO) The Nuremberg Code

(CO) Ezekiel J. Emanuel, David Wendler, Christine Grady, “What Makes Clinical Research Ethical?” in *JAMA*

WATCH: *The Deadly Deception*, 1993, 60 min. ([Part I](#) and [Part II](#))

Week 15 – November 28 & 30

Does our study of religion, ethics, and medicine help us to reframe policy debates concerning health care access and global health?

Villarosa, Chapter 8, “Putting the Care Back in Health Care: Solutions”

(CO) John D. Arras, “The Right to Health Care” in *The Routledge Companion to Bioethics*

(CO) Paul Farmer, “Health, Healing, and Social Justice” in *In The Company of the Poor: Conversations with Dr. Paul Farmer and Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez*

Week 16 – December 5

Conclusion

Final Examination – Thursday, December 15, 9am-12pm