**Representative Democracy and its Critics** (PLPT 4500)

**The University of Virginia**

**Department of Politics**

**Fall 2022**

Instructor: Danielle Charette Location: New Cabell Hall 042

Email: dcharette@virginia.edu Time: Tuesday evenings, 7-9:30pm

Office Hours: Weds. noon-3pm, or by appt.

Office Location: Gibson 154

# **Course Description**

What do we mean by political representation? And is it compatible with democracy? This discussion-based seminar investigates the rise of the modern representative republic, with a focus on debates concerning the role of elections, the relationship between citizens and office-holders, the duties of representatives, and the size and structure of the modern regime. Major authors include Hobbes, Rousseau, Burke, Sièyes, Paine, Mill, Schmitt, and Arendt. We will also sample contemporary work on deliberative democracy and proposals for forms of non-electoral representation.

**Texts**

The following texts are required and available at the UVA bookstore. Please purchase the following editions:

Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ed. Edwin Curley (Hackett, 1994)

Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *The Social Contract & Later Political Writings,* ed. Victor Gourevitch (Cambridge, 1997)

Emmanuel Joseph Sieyès, *Political Writings,* ed. Michael Sonenscher (Hackett, 2003)

Thomas Paine, *Rights of Man, Common Sense, and Other Political Writings*, ed. Mark Philp (Oxford, 1995)

John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty, Utilitarianism, and Other Essays*, eds. Mark Philp and Frederick Rosen, 2nd ed., (Oxford, 2015)

Hannah Arendt, *On Revolution* (Penguin, 2006)

**\*\****All other readings will be available as PDFs on Collab***\*\***

**Assignments and Grading**

1. **Two close-readings** of a primary text of your choice (pre-1965). Papers should carefully analyze a specific aspect of the author’s claims and argumentative strategy in no more than 3 pages (double-spaced, 12 pt. font). **Both close-readings should be handed in before Friday, December 9 at 5pm. *Worth 10% each.***
2. **Two synopses** of a contemporary article of your choice (i.e. Dunn, Manin, Guerrero, Mansbridge, Landemore, Cohen, Thompson & Gutmann, or Saward). These should summarize and evaluate the author’s core claims in no more than 2 pages (double-spaced). *Synopses must be submitted in advance of the seminar in which we discuss the article.* ***Worth 7.5% each.***
3. **Final Paper,** 12-20 pages (double-spaced) on a topic of your choice. The paper calls for a clear and well-supported thesis. You should draw upon at least three of our assigned texts, in addition to several well-chosen secondary sources. **Students should discuss their topic with me at least 2 weeks in advance of the final due date.**

*A draft of the introductory paragraph and an outline* are due **Monday, December 5** **by 5pm**. ***Worth 5%.***

**The complete paper is due Wednesday, December 14 by 5pm.** *A third of a letter grade will be deducted each day the paper is late.* ***Worth 40%.***

1. **Participation.** Successful participation is much more than being present. To receive a good grade, you must read the required readings thoroughly before each class. Be prepared to answer questions, to raise queries of your own, and to listen respectfully and actively to your colleagues. Barring extraordinary circumstances, attendance at every seminar session is expected, and repeated absences will result in a failing participation grade. ***Worth 20%.***

**Honor Code at the University of Virginia**

All work completed for this course falls under the guidelines of the Honor System. Students have pledged never to lie, cheat, or steal. Offenses will be reported to the Honor Committee, and instances of cheating or plagiarism will result in an F in the course.

**N.B.** *Our seminar scheduled for the Tuesday before Thanksgiving (Nov. 22) will be via Zoom*.

\*\*\*

**Week I. Introduction** (Aug. 23)

Benjamin Constant, “The Liberty of Ancients Compared with that of Moderns” (1819)

John Dunn, *Setting the People Free* (2005)*,* preface, pp. xvii-xxv; “Democracy’s First Coming,” pp. 1-47

**Week II. Ancient Athens: Democracy without Representation?** (Aug. 30)

Thucydides, *The Peloponnesian War*: Pericles’ Funeral Oration (II.33-47) and the Mytilenean Debate (III.36-50)

Aristotle, *Politics*, Book 1, chaps. 1-2; Book 3, chaps. 1-5, 7-11; Book 4, chaps. 3-13; Book 6, chaps. 1-5

Bernard Manin, “Direct Democracy and Representation,” in *Principles of Representative Government* (1997), pp. 8-41

Alexander Guerrero, “Against Elections”, *Philosophy & Public Affairs* (2014)

**Week III.** **Hobbes: Representation without Democracy?** (Sept. 6)

Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan* (1651):

Letter Dedicatory and Introduction: pp. 1-5

Chap. 13-18 (all), pp. 74-118

Chap. 19 (paragraphs 1-8, 14-23), pp. 118-121, pp. 124-127

Chap. 20 (paras. 1-15, 18-19), pp. 127-132, 135

Chap. 21 (all), pp. 136-145

Chap. 30 (paras. 1-9, 12-24, 27), pp. 219-223

**Week IV. Representing large modern governments** (Sept. 13)

Montesquieu, *Spirit of the Laws* (1748), Book 2, chaps. 1-5 (pp. 10-20); Book 3, chaps. 1-11 (pp. 21-30); book 11, chaps. 1-8 (pp. 154-168)

David Hume, “Idea of a Perfect Commonwealth” (1752)

*Federalist Papers* (1787/88), nos. 9, 10, 14, 39, 51, 63

**Week V. Whom should a representative represent?** (Sept. 20)

Edmund Burke, “Speech to the Electors of Bristol” (1774) and “Speech on the Reform of the Representation of the Commons in Parliament” (1782)

Amicus, “A Plea for the Right to Recall”, *The Columbian Herald* (1788)

Brutus III on representation in the House of Representatives, *New York Journal* (1787)

Melancton Smith, Speech in the New York Ratification Convention (1788)

Jane Mansbridge, “Should Blacks Represent Blacks and Women Represent Women?” *Journal of Politics* (1999)

Hélène Landemore, “Between Burke and the Anti-Federalists: An Epistemic Argument for Descriptive Representation” (2011)

**Week VI: Rousseau’s *Social Contract*** (Sept. 27)

Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *Of the Social Contract* (1762),pp. 41-152

**\*\*Reading days: *no class*** (Oct. 4)**\*\***

**Week VII: Revolution and Representation** (Oct. 11)

Emmanuel Joseph Sieyès, “What is the Third Estate?” (1788/89), pp. 92-162

**Week VIII: Revolution and Democracy I** (Oct. 18)

Thomas Paine, *Rights of Man* (1791), Book II, pp. 202-262

Thomas Jefferson to Samuel Kercheval (1816)

Hannah Arendt, *On Revolution* (1963), pp. 11-25, 31-7

**Week IX. Revolution and Democracy II** (Oct. 25)

Maximilien Robespierre, “On the Principles of Political Morality” (1794)

Arendt, *On Revolution* pp. 63-71, 106-131, 133-70, 207-40

**Week X. Mill on Representative Government** (Nov. 1)

John Stuart Mill, *Considerations on Representative Government* (1861)*,* chaps. 1-6 (pp. 181-263), start of chap. 7, pp. 264-268 only

**\*\*Election day: no class** (Nov. 8)**\*\***

**Week XI. Parliamentarism, Presidentialism, and their Problems** (Nov. 15)

Max Weber, “Politics as a Vocation” (1918)

Carl Schmitt, *The Crisis of Parliamentary Democracy* (1923), pp. 22-50

Schmitt, *The Concept of the Political* (1932), pp. 19-37

Chang Che, “The Nazi Inspiring China’s Communists,” *Atlantic* (2020)

**Week XII: Democratic Deliberation and Intelligence** (Nov. 22, *via Zoom*)

John Dewey, *The Public and its Problems* (1927), excerpts

Mill, *Considerations on Representative Government*, chaps. 8, 10

Joshua Cohen, “Procedure and Substance in Deliberative Democracy” (1997)

Dennis Thompson and Amy Gutmann, *Why Deliberative Democracy* (2004), excerpts

**Week XIII: Rethinking Representative Structures** (Nov. 29)

Oliver Escobar and Stephen Elstub, “Forms of Mini-Publics”

Andrew Rehfield, *The Concept of Constituency* (2005), pp. 3-12, pp. 240-244

Hélène Landemore, *Open Democracy* (2020), chaps. 4 and 7

**\*\*\*Outline and draft intro paragraph due by Monday, Dec. 5 at 5pm\*\*\***

**Week XIV: Conclusion** (Dec. 6)

Michael Saward, “The Representative Claim” (2006)

**\*\*\*FINAL PAPER** **due by Wednesday, December 14 at 5pm\*\*\***